

Dear Springer, et. al.:

I am writing to report a strange and disturbing case of apparent plagiarism in a recent issue of the journal [Scientometrics](#).

The article in question is this one:

Akhmat, Ghulam, Zaman, Khalie, Shukui, Tan, & Ahmed, Tauseef. (2013). [Educational reforms and internationalization of universities: evidence from major regions of the world](#). *Scientometrics* 98, 2185-2205.

It appears that much of the article's text is copied, paragraph by paragraph, from various sources freely available through the internet. I set out to document the apparent plagiarism in the entire document but stopped after a few pages because there is so much copying to report.

The article does throw in a citation at the end of each paragraph, but there is no use of quotation marks, and the paragraphs are copied word for word. Thus, the portion of the paper I analyzed is just a selection of copied paragraphs from other authors, with very little original text.

I attach documentation here in a .doc file. The left column contains the text of the article. The right column contains the original text and is hyperlinked to its source. Examining the file, you'll see that entire paragraphs are copied, one after another, from various sources. Yes, they are cited, but what's the point of publishing a new article, the beginning of which is merely paragraphs copied from previously written papers?

I request that you investigate this report and take appropriate action. Please share the results of your investigation and the action you will take with me.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. I am certain that you do not want to diminish the reputation of the journal *Scientometrics* by publishing so much unoriginal text in a new article.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey Beall, MA, MSLS, Associate Professor  
Scholarly Initiatives Librarian  
Auraria Library  
University of Colorado Denver  
1100 Lawrence St.  
Denver, Colo. 80204 USA  
(303) 534-8600  
[jeffrey.beall@ucdenver.edu](mailto:jeffrey.beall@ucdenver.edu)



Akhmat, Ghulam, Zaman, Khalie, Shukui, Tan, & Ahmed, Tauseef. (2014). [Educational reforms and internationalization of universities: evidence from major regions of the world](#). *Scientometrics* 98, 2185-2205.

Original source of the text. The hyperlink leads to the original source of the text.

## Introduction

Education is generally viewed as an important determinant for economic growth. In recent years, international mobility of students in higher education has increased substantially and further growth is expected. This raises the question how the international flows of students will affect economic growth in general and in particular in those countries that either receive or send many students (Bergerhoff et al. 2013).

International student recruitment is becoming integral to the financial health of many higher education institutions worldwide, in addition to remaining an important means of attracting talent and expanding campus diversity. A new environment of budgetary cuts and increasing competition is forcing many institutions to become strategic in their international recruitment efforts (WES 2012).

Higher education participation and enrolment has expanded considerably over the past century, and particularly since 1970. However, growth predicted over the 30 years from 2000 to 2030 is likely to be higher than that experienced between 1970 and 2000. The number of students enrolled in higher education by 2030 is forecast to rise from 99.4 million in 2000 to 414.2 million in 2030—an increase of 314 % (Calderon 2012).

In the report of European Commission (EU 2012), Europe has around 4,000 higher education institutions, with over 19 million students and 1.5 million staff. Some European universities are among the best in the world, but, overall, potential is not being fully realized. Curricula are not always up to date, not enough young people go to university, and not enough adults have ever attended university. European universities often lack the management tools and funding to match their ambitions. In the light of these challenges, governments and higher education institutions are looking for ways to create better conditions for universities. Middle East and North African (MENA) region has made significant strides in the education sector, having started in the 1960s and 1970s from very low levels of human capital accumulation. However, it has not capitalized fully on past investments in education, let alone developed education systems capable of meeting new challenges. The education systems did not produce what the markets needed, and the markets were not sufficiently developed to absorb the educated labor force into the most efficient uses. Thus, the region needs to travel a new road (World Bank 2008a). Europe is the largest receiving

Education is generally viewed as an important determinant for economic growth. In recent years, international mobility of students in higher education has increased substantially and further growth is expected. This raises the question how the international flows of students will affect economic growth in general and in particular in those countries that either receive or send many students.

International student recruitment is becoming integral to the financial health of many higher education institutions worldwide, in addition to remaining an important means of attracting talent and expanding campus diversity. A new environment of budgetary cuts and increasing competition is forcing many institutions to become strategic in their international recruitment efforts.

Higher education participation and enrolment has expanded considerably over the past century, and particularly since 1970. However, growth predicted over the 30 years from 2000 to 2030 is likely to be higher than that experienced between 1970 and 2000. The number of students enrolled in higher education by 2030 is forecast to rise from 99.4 million in 2000 to 414.2 million in 2030—an increase of 314%.

Europe has around 4,000 higher education institutions, with over 19 million students and 1.5 million staff. Some European universities are among the best in the world.

Curricula are not always up to date, not enough young people go to university, and not enough adults have ever attended university. European universities often lack the management tools and funding to match their ambitions. In the light of these challenges, governments and higher education institutions are looking for ways to create better conditions for universities.

region has made significant strides in the education sector, having started in the 1960s and 1970s from very low levels of human capital accumulation. However, it has not capitalized fully on past investments in education, let alone developed education systems capable of meeting new challenges. The education systems did not produce what the markets needed, and the markets were not sufficiently developed to absorb the educated labor force into the most efficient uses. Thus, the region needs to travel a new road. Europe is the largest receiving region among

region among OECD countries with 840,000 foreign students but many of these students are moving from one European country to another. About half (52 %) of foreign students in Europe are European. North America receives fewer students in absolute terms (with 520,000 foreign students in the United States, Canada and Mexico), but ranks first in terms of openness to other regions, with Asian students representing almost two-thirds (60 %) of all foreign students in North America (OECD 2010).

Amidst educational progress, development strategies built on schooling have disappointed because expansion of school attainment has not guaranteed improved economic conditions. A case in point is Latin America. In 1960, adult school attainment in Latin America was surpassed only by OECD countries and was significantly ahead of East Asia, Sub-Saharan Africa, and the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region. Still, economic growth in Latin America over the four decades since 1960 lagged so much behind growth in East Asia and MENA that Latin American income per capita, which was considerably above that of the other three regions in 1960, has been overtaken by East Asia and MENA, leaving only Sub-Saharan Africa behind (Hanushek and Woessmann 2009).

In 2008, some 105 million adults were illiterate in East Asia and the Pacific, down by 54 % over the previous 15 years. Of this total, 71 % are women, and more than three-quarters of illiterate adults live in just two countries: China and Indonesia. The average adult literacy rate increased from 82 % in 1985-1994 to almost 94 % in 2005-2008. Most of the few countries with data available for both periods improved their adult literacy rates. In China, the number of illiterate adults declined by 19 million from 2000 to 2008 and the adult literacy rate rose from 91 to 94 % over the period. The regional adult literacy rate masks some important disparities between countries. Less than four-fifths of adults in Cambodia, the Lao People's Democratic Republic and Papua New Guinea are literate, while the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Samoa and Tonga have achieved universal adult literacy (UNESCO 2011). According to another report published by UNESCO (2012) shows that governments in North America and Western Europe invested the highest shares of national resources in education: 5.6 % of GDP. The region is followed by the Arab States (4.9 %) and sub-Saharan Africa (4.5 %). The regions of Latin America and the Caribbean as well as Central and Eastern Europe are close to the world average, with 4.4 and 4.2 % respectively. By far the lowest level of public spending is found

OECD countries with 840,000 foreign students but many of these students are moving from one European country to another. About half (52 %) of foreign students in Europe are European. North America receives fewer students in absolute terms (with 520,000 foreign students in the United States, Canada and Mexico), but ranks first in terms of openness to other regions, with Asian students representing almost two-thirds (60 %) of all foreign students in North America.

Amidst educational progress, development strategies built on schooling have disappointed because expansion of school attainment has not guaranteed improved economic conditions. A case in point is Latin America. In 1960, adult school attainment in Latin America was surpassed only by OECD countries and was significantly ahead of East Asia, Sub-Saharan Africa, and the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region. Still, economic growth in Latin America over the four decades since 1960 lagged so much behind growth in East Asia and MENA that Latin American income per capita, which was considerably above that of the other three regions in 1960, has been overtaken by East Asia and MENA, leaving only Sub-Saharan Africa behind.

In 2008, some 105 million adults were illiterate in East Asia and the Pacific, down by 54 % over the previous 15 years. Of this total, 71 % are women, and more than three-quarters of illiterate adults live in just two countries: China and Indonesia. The average adult literacy rate increased from 82 % in 1985-1994 to almost 94 % in 2005-2008. Most of the few countries with data available for both periods improved their adult literacy rates. In China, the number of illiterate adults declined by 19 million from 2000 to 2008 and the adult literacy rate rose from 91 to 94 % over the period. The regional adult literacy rate masks some important disparities between countries. Less than four-fifths of adults in Cambodia, the Lao People's Democratic Republic and Papua New Guinea are literate, while the Democratic People's Republic of Korea, Samoa and Tonga have achieved universal adult literacy.

governments in North America and Western Europe invested the highest shares of national resources in education: 5.6 % of GDP. The region is followed by the Arab States (4.9 %) and sub-Saharan Africa (4.5 %). The regions of Latin America and the Caribbean as well as Central and Eastern Europe are close to the world average, with 4.4 and 4.2 % respectively, By far the lowest level of public spending is found in

in Central Asia and in East Asia and the Pacific—both of which report only 2.8 % of GDP.

Developing Asia's stock of human capital, its well-educated labor force which is often cited as one of the critical factors in the region's rapid economic growth. This argument is supported by the region's record in educational attainment over the past four decades. In 2010, its population aged 15 years and over had an average of 7.8 years of schooling, from just 4.1 years in 1970. Nonetheless, progress in educational attainment has not been uniform across countries and subregions, and the links between education, on one hand, and productivity and income growth, on the other, have not been always clear (ADB 2010). Africa scores the lowest higher education participation rate in the world. The average gross rate of tertiary education enrolment (GER) was 8 % in 2011. This range differs from country to country, For instance, in 2009 the tertiary GER exceeds the regional average in the following countries: Cameroon (9.0 %), Cape Verde (14.9 %), Côte d'Ivoire (8.4 %), Guinea (9.2 %), Mauritius (25.9 %), Namibia (8.9 %) and Senegal (8.0 %). However, the ratio remains quite low in countries such as: Burkina Faso (3.4 %), Burundi (2.7 %), Central African Republic (2.5 %), Chad (2.0 %), Eritrea (2.0 %), Ethiopia (3.6 %), Madagascar (3.6 %), Malawi (0.5 %), Niger (1.4 %) and Uganda (3.7 %). The tertiary gross enrollment ratio for Anglophone countries averaged 6.7 %, in comparison to the 2.9 % that characterized Francophone nations (Montanini 2013). GDP growth in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) has accelerated to over 6.0 % on average during 2002–2007. This remarkable economic turnaround a welcome development after more than two decades of stagnation which is the result of increasing macroeconomic stability, of reforms that have reduced market imperfections and trade barriers, and most consequentially, of rapidly increasing global demand for the region's natural resource-based commodities (World Bank 2008b).

Central Asia and in East Asia and the Pacific—both of which report only 2.8 % of GDP.

Developing Asia's stock of human capital, its well-educated labor force which is often cited as one of the critical factors in the region's rapid economic growth. This argument is supported by the region's record in educational attainment over the past four decades. In 2010, its population aged 15 years and over had an average of 7.8 years of schooling, from just 4.1 years in 1970. Nonetheless, progress in educational attainment has not been uniform across countries and subregions, and the links between education, on one hand, and productivity and income growth, on the other, have not been always clear. Africa scores the lowest higher education participation rate in the world. The average gross rate of tertiary education enrolment (GER) was 8 % in 2011. This range differs from country to country, For instance, in 2009 the tertiary GER exceeds the regional average in the following countries: Cameroon (9.0 %), Cape Verde (14.9 %), Côte d'Ivoire (8.4 %), Guinea (9.2 %), Mauritius (25.9 %), Namibia (8.9 %) and Senegal (8.0 %). However, the ratio remains quite low in countries such as: Burkina Faso (3.4 %), Burundi (2.7 %), Central African Republic (2.5 %), Chad (2.0 %), Eritrea (2.0 %), Ethiopia (3.6 %), Madagascar (3.6 %), Malawi (0.5 %), Niger (1.4 %) and Uganda (3.7 %). The tertiary gross enrollment ratio for Anglophone countries averaged 6.7 %, in comparison to the 2.9 % that characterized Francophone nations.

GDP growth in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA) has accelerated to over 6.0 % on average during 2002–2007. This remarkable economic turnaround a welcome development after more than two decades of stagnation which is the result of increasing macroeconomic stability, of reforms that have reduced market imperfections and trade barriers, and most consequentially, of rapidly increasing global demand for the region's natural resource-based commodities.

|  |  |
|--|--|
|  |  |
|--|--|

